

## GREAT LESSON IDEAS – ELA

## THE ART OF QUESTIONING

K.A. SCHAEFER, 12<sup>th</sup> GRADE ELA, BRONXVILLE HIGH SCHOOL

## TRANSCRIPTION OF ALL THE QUESTIONS ASKED IN THE LESSON

<i>K.A. Schaefer's Questions</i>
Let's say you feel a little sick and you show up at his hospital and he comes walking out to treat you. Based on what you've read, would you want him as your doctor?
Could you think of a pro & a con about having this man as your doctor? Something he might be good at or something that might make you a little nervous? Or something that you uh... wouldn't want him to treat you for?
What was the risk... that he subjected her to by performing that biopsy? What was the risk attached with that?
Was he putting her in danger by his style of doctoring?
Are you saying that you feel like Dr. Gawande does the right thing in this essay?
That he behaves as a doctor... as you would want a doctor to behave?
Can you tell me what it is about the disease that she has that makes it so difficult for a doctor to know what to do about it?
Anyone want to say anything else about this disease and the challenges that it poses for a doctor?
We're talking about a disease that you can't know you have until it's too late to save you, then do you want a doctor who does this?...
Are there any cons to this? Any reasons that you, in other situations, you might not want this?
Can you think of a moment in the story where he wants to take a risk and it's actually dangerous? Or a moment where he wants to take a risk and you wouldn't want him to be that risky with you?
Do you remember what the risk of that surgery would have been for her if they had operated; what would that have potentially subjected her to?
Her doctors, especially Dr. Gawande end up having to make two decisions about how to treat her, what's the first major decision that they have to make when she comes in about her care?
What's the second big decision that they're going to have to figure out here; once they figure out she has it? What then are they deliberating between?
Do you see how incoherent these decisions are?
So it didn't seem risky to just leave the leg to you?
Now I'm gonna turn to you to see if you can sum up, what you think this essay is trying to say overall.

## GREAT LESSON IDEAS – ELA

## THE ART OF QUESTIONING

K.A. SCHAEFER, 12<sup>th</sup> GRADE ELA, BRONXVILLE HIGH SCHOOL

## TRANSCRIPTION OF ALL THE QUESTIONS ASKED IN THE LESSON

What's the point here, the bottom line? Could you write a sentence just to try to capture what this man's point is?
Off the top of your head, how would you explain that, what is this essay trying to say?
Does it go beyond just medicine for that uncertainty?
How do you get from the initial situation to your solution, your decision?
What sort of factors does the brain use...to solve a problem?
Any other elements go into figuring things out, we used past experience, what else do we use?
What do you think about the role of luck in this essay?
Talk to me about how Eleanor is lucky?
So when you finish this essay, when you think about what it means, do you find that the meaning is optimistic or do you find that the meaning is disturbing or unsettling?
Let's say, you know, you do step on it, should we feel like 'hey, this is pretty good' what the human mind does, 'Ted you have a chance to make it' or should we feel like 'uh I don't feel so good about this?'
Do you feel like this is an optimistic message or a disturbing one?
But doesn't it seem like...doctors, are sort of in every situation they're just kind of evaluating it in a fresh way?
...in other words there's so much uncertainty.
How can a doctor have confidence?
What I'm asking you to think about now is, how this essay structures the argument?
...specifically I'm interested in whether you think that this essay seems like a traditional essay, a thesis essay. Or does it feel like this essay is structured in a different way?
You could think about does the writer use evidence, like we do when we write a thesis essay, or is this evidence different?
You could think about is there a thesis at the front and then he goes onto prove it or is it different?
What if his point is that there's always two ways to go?
Can you look on the first page of this essay to see if there is something like a thesis?
You all just wrote college application essays. Think about yours in your mind. Did you organize that like a thesis essay? Or was that structured in a different way?
If you said that your college application essay wasn't really like a thesis essay, then where did the point come in if it wasn't up at the top?
Do you know what an essay that makes its point at the end is called?